DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 284 022 CE 047 830

AUTHOR Arger, Geoff
TITLE Promise and Reality: A Critical Analysis of the Literature Available in Australia on Distance Education in the Third World.
PUB DATE [85]
NOTE 24p.
PUB TYPE Information Analyses (070)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC01 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS Change Strategies; *Developing Nations; *Distance Education; *Economic Development; Educational Benefits; *Educational Change; Educational Needs; Foreign Countries; Futures (of Society); Intervention; Literature Reviews; *Outcomes of Education; Postsecondary Education; Program Improvement; *Relevance (Education)
IDENTIFIERS *Australia

ABSTRACT

From its earliest development, distance education has promised inexpensive, egalitarian, high quality mass education. An examination of the literature about distance education in developing nations indicates that the gulf between what distance education is promising to achieve in these nations and what it is actually achieving is wide and will likely remain so. The current rhetoric of distance education is that it can assist developing nations because it is a vehicle of large-scale, quality education that brings about social equality in a cost-effective manner. A critical analysis of this literature reveals, however, that there is no real evidence that this has been or even can be achieved. Such an analysis also indicates that, as it is presently practiced, distance education in the world's developing nations is interwoven with the so-called modernization paradigm of development. Because it is based on Eurocentric premises, this paradigm appears to be of little use in the world's developing nations. The literature would appear to indicate that these two factors are interwoven and that until the development paradigm becomes more appropriate to the needs of these developing nations, the difference between the potential and reality of distance education's contribution to national development in these countries will remain limited. An eight-page bibliography is included. (MN)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

ED284022

UNIVERSITY OF NEW ENGLAND, ARMIDALE, AUSTRALIA

PROMISE AND REALITY: A CRITICAL ANALYSIS OF THE LITERATURE AVAILABLE IN AUSTRALIA ON DISTANCE EDUCATION IN THE THIRD WORLD

GEOFF ARGER

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

☑ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

G Arger

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

CE041830

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

PROMISE AND REALITY: A CRITICAL ANALYSIS OF THE LITERATURE AVAILABLE IN AUSTRALIA ON DISTANCE EDUCATION IN THE THIRD WORLD

GEOFF ARGER

ABSTRACT

The editors of the 1982 ICCE conference proceedings noted that:

> ... with respect to distance education the difference between potential and reality is one of the striking themes ... contributors who deal with the role of distance education and national development do tend to stress the gulf between what could be done and what is actually being done.
>
> (ICCE 1982:52)

This paper argues that the gulf beween what could be done and what is actually being done will remain. An examination of the literature, which is readily available in Australia about distance education in the Third World, indicates that the promise of distance education, which is expressed in the rhetoric, is that it can assist Third World development because it is a vehicle of large scale, quality education, effecting social equality in a cost-efficient manner. A critical analysis of the same literature, however, demonstrates that the evidence does not indicate that in reality this has been or will be, achieved. Such an analysis also indicates that distance education as presently practised in the Third World is interwoven with the so called modernisation paradigm of development. It is noted that this paradigm has eurocentric premises which are unsuitable for the Third World. It is argued that these two factors are related, and that until the development paradigm, within which distance education operates, becomes more appropriate to Third World's needs, then the difference between the potential and the reality of distance education's contribution to national development in the Third World will remain the "striking theme" noted above.

PROMISE AND REALITY: A CRITICAL ANALYSIS OF THE LITERATURE AVAILABLE IN AUSTRALIA ON DISTANCE EDUCATION IN THE THIRD WORLD

INTRODUCTION

From its earliest development in the late 19th century distance education, or correspondence education as it was then called, has always promised cheap, egalitarian, quality, mass education. In practice, however, such promise has rarely been fulfilled.

The promise of distance education was revived in the fifties in Latin America, and in the sixties in Africa and South East Asia, because western style conventional education was increasingly perceived to have failed to have any impact on Third World Development. The advocates of the widely accepted modernisation paradigm of development argued that the failure was not because of the incorrectness of the paradigm itself, but rather because of the internal structural deficiencies which distance education could overcome. In Third World terms distance education has been promoted as a means of reducing some of the crucial problems in Third World education such as urban-rural drift, the brain drain, over-dependency on expatriate advisors/experts, irrelevant curriculum, and particularly, growing neo-colonial links. However, it can be used simply as another way of dispensing western education.

This study critically and empirically analyses the literature readily available in Australia, which advocated that distance education was, and is, suitable for the Third World. It argues that distance education like, face-to-face education, failed, and fails, to live up to it's promise because the development paradigm it is based upon had, and has, erroneous promises. It is a study at one level about distance education, but at another it is a comment on decolonisation and on the development paradigm which was, and is, an inextricable part of that process.

METHODOLOGY

It should be emphasized that it is not an exhaustive literature review, nor is it meant to be. It is a critical review of the literature advocating the promise of distance education that was, and is, readily available in Australia to any who wanted information on the development aspects of distance education in the Third World. It is a critical review which looks beyond the rhetoric, establishes the reality and draws out the underlying premises in the presumed development strategies.

With this intention in mind, the bibliography used was generated from three major sources, namely; computer files, library held books, and personal contacts. A computer generated search of the ERIC Files held using the descriptors, "correspondence study/distance education" with "post-secondary education" and "higher education", gave 181 references which were reduced to 22 relevant to the Third World. The monthly ERIC document service also produced thirteen Third World distance education references. A search of the books held in a CAE offering, amongst others, teacher education diplomas and degrees, gave a significant contribution from the bibliographies in Distance Teaching in The Third World by Young, Jenkins, Perraton and Dodds (1980), and Trends and Status of Distance Education by Holmberg (1981). Books in Print was also consulted under the sub-heading, 'Correspondence Schools and Courses'. The bibliography thus compiled was then processed for Inter-library loan. This acted as a culling process because some of the references, particularly in Young et al's book, where either inadequate or unavailable. Nevertheless, this method did result in the acquisition of 85% of the material reviewed.The other 15% was acquired through professional contacts with members of the Australian and South Pacific External Studies Association (ASPESA) and the International Council of Distance Educators (ICDE). The Distance Teaching Universities by Rumble and Harry (eds.) (1981) was also referred to, as were the books Distance Education International Perspectives by Stewart, Keegan and Holmberg (1984), and Distance Education: Theory and Practice by Keegan (1984). The final result of this three-pronged search was a review of a mixed collection of readily available academic journal articles, authored books and edited books.

THE PROMISE OF THE RHETORIC

The literature suggests that a great attraction of distance education is that it promises quantity education not only through University Primary Education[1], but also by upgrading teachers[2], beaurocrats[3], professionals[4], and

---

1 Singh 1979:77 and 1982:61; Ansere 1982:53; Rumble and Harry 1982:190; Kabwasa 1969:244-245; Hooper 1976:125; Goodenough 1978:13

2 Edros and Clarke 1971:13; Kinyanjui 1974a:5; Edstrom 1966:17; Kabwasa and Kaunda 1973 1973:54; Edstrom et al 1970:126; Perraton 1973:5; Pires and Bartram 1975:278; Kiporir 1975:202; CEDO 1974:234

3 Kabwasa and Kaunda 1973:36; Edstrom 1969:218-221; Kabwasa 1969:243-246; Edstrom et al 1970:364; CEDO 1974:247; Heap 1972:73

4 Kabwasa 1969:243-6; Falkes 1973:16; El-Bushra 1973:56; Beardsley 1975:192; Harry 1978:101

even new target groups[5]. The rise of distance education professionalism, manifest in the appearance of professional bodies like ICCE, and ASPESA, as well as in the writing of manuals[6] and the use of modern technology[7], promised that such education would be of a quality which could facilitate education in areas where conventional teaching was inadequate[8]. This education promised to encourage a shift to social equality by educating the masses[9] and effecting social change[10]. Perhaps the greatest attraction of distance education to the Third World was its potential cheapness both because it wouldn't cost much to establish[11], and because it would attract foreign aid[12].

In total, the promise of distance education was portrayed as being able to offer mass, quality, cost-efficient education which could effect social change. A great promise indeed! Such rhetoric, however, begs the questions, "Is this promise valid? Is it based on empirical evidence?" To answer these questions the remainder of this paper critically examines the evidence given in the same literature in which this rhetoric has been expressed.

---

5 Edstrom 1966:18; Hakemulder 1979:220; El-Bushra 1973:8; Perraton 1973:43; Kaye 1978:15; Answere 1982:62

6 Edstrom 1969; Erdos and Clark 1971; Greenholm 1975

7 Dodds 1972:45; see also Perraton 1973:19; Young et al 1980:37; Hurley 1981:358; Dodds 1972: Introduction; White 1977b:172; Rogers and Braun 1977:362

8 Edstrom 1969:212; Edstrom 1966:18-20; CEDO 1974:239; Kinyanjui 1977:156; Hakemulker 1979:376; Young et al 1980:46; Rumble and Harry 1982:242

9 Hurley 1981:355; Edstrom 1969:221; Brumberg 1975:1 and 56; Fleming 1982:126

10 Kinyanjiu 1974:33; CEDO 1974:23; Arnove 1976:xviii; Dodds 1973:17

11 Edstrom 1969:227; Edstrom et al 1969:275; Kabwasa 1973:145; Edros and Clarke 1971:12; Kagaruki and Mwakatobe 1973:34; Pereira 1972:70; White 1977b:174; Cassiper 1977:30; CEDO 1974:221; Young et al 1980:58; Hakemulder 1979; Singh 1979:77; Adedeji 1979:28; Holmberg 1979:48

12 Petrouchine 1969:302; Edstrom 1966:80; Hakemulder 1979:381; Weidhaup 1976:43; Nsibandze and Green 1978:116; Cassiper 1977:38; Kaunda and Kabwasa 1973:78; Edros 1973:78; Hurley 1982:256; Young et al 1980:x; Ahmed and Coombes 1975:xi

THE REALITY OF THE ACTION

The Reality of Quantity

The promise that distance education can produce large quantities of educated manpower is dependent on the presence of certain pre-requisites in the Third World. In the mid-sixties Edstrom noted them as being: a good mass communication system; a good home environment; language fluency; skilled course writer; printing capabilities; recognition of this type of learning as legitimate; and being geared to specific goals rather than long term goals (Edstrom 1966:21). Unfortunately, such pre-requisites are not found in abundance in the Third World. Yet very little awareness of this factor is apparent in the subsequent literature. Nevertheless, their validity remains, and reports of postal mishaps (Heap 1972:12), poor broadcasting reception (CEDO 1974:202); inadequate home conditions (Kember 1981:182); poor language proficiency (Edstrom 1966:47); the shortage of trained distance educators (Gupta 1982:66); print-shop deficiencies (Hakemulder 1979:48); and even paper shortages (Kaye 1978:6); as well as the resistance of traditional educators and students (ICCE 1982:52); are numerous and cannot be dismissed lightly. It is repeated that the above are pre-requisites for distance education, not minor problems to be overcome in the implementation of the system. Without such facilities the promise that distance education can produce large quantities of trained manpower is seriously compromised. Yet such problems are characteristic, almost by definition, of the Third World. They can only be eradicated by the very development that distance education promises. It is a Catch 22 situation which hits at the very basis of distance education's promises.

When such pre-requisites are not met, the problems inherent in the preparation, production and delivery of the courses increase significantly. The "dearth of competent writers" (Edstrom 1966:47), or writers "unused to methodology, editing and communication" (Hakemulder 1979:220), result in material "written in essay format in the third person" (indicating lack of involvement), in an "unattractive mimeographed form" (Gupta 1982:66). Radio programmes, moreover, suffer greatly from the low level of technical expertise (Spain 1977:88; Agawal 1976:713; CEDO 1974:202). The promise of a large quantity of educated manpower through distance education techniques cannot materialise unless the structural pre-requisites necessary for the system to operate are present.

There are also severe delivery problems. Postal delays have been noted, but Dodd's (1972:16-17) comment that in Tanzania the postal delay meant that up to half, (including the group leaders who were to lead the discussions), didn't receive the books whilst the radio programmes were in progress,

indicates the magnitude of the problem. In this case the campaign failed. Perhaps the other delivery problem which was often ignored is the simple fact that many areas of the Third World do not have electricity; Kaye (1978:6) reported that in Pakistan it was only 9% of the population. Agarwal (1976:713) further argued that batteries were uneconomical. Thus, not surprisingly, the Commonwealth Secretariat (CEDO 1974:202) concluded that the ephemeral nature of broadcasts, quality of reception, repair of sets, theft of sets, and lack of feedback, are a substantial and, it is suggested here, a crippling problem.

In short, the logistical capabilities of distance education in the Third World to prepare, produce, and deliver programmes, which would result in large quantities of skilled educated manpower, is seriously questioned. Moreover, the planning capabilities are often "inaccurate", using "poor statistics", and an "unsatisfactory survey of skills". Thus, the academic courses offered are not necessarily the most appropriate, given the manpower needs of the country in general, and the growing problem of graduate unemployment in particular (Edstrom et al 1969:54; Goodenough 1978:22; see also Carnoy 1980; Blaug 1970; Dore 1976). Indeed, given this last phenomena, the wisdom of a large scale increase in the quantity of graduates produced by distance education methods must be seriously questioned.

Even in the sixties Edstrom et al (1969:251) warned that African adult students' interest was in the paper certificate and formal qualifications. This was true of much of the Third World, and the consequences soon emerged. Dodds (1973:20) wrote of the "enormous competition for jobs" and the concentration on academic qualifications", characteristics of the 'Diploma Disease' that Dore (1976) had cogently written about. Pereira (1969:333) noted a similar phenomena in Asia. Datt (1982:63) put it in even more stark terms when he argued that correspondence directorates were nothing but extensions of university departments created only to accommodate their overflow, and that the demand for education was a consequence of unemployment. Now, even if this was not applicable to all education, it certainly throws a great question mark over the claim that if distance education can, it should increase the number of formally trained graduates in the Third World. However, in fact, such ethnocentricism was also applicable to rural education. It was argued that for many, rural education was a vehicle by which to escape the rural area ... . So distance education was "useful in the process of rural education but rural education emerges as hardly useful at all" (Spain 1977:69).

In toto, the ability of distance education methods to produce vast quantities of graduates without changes in the socio-economic structures of the real Third World, is seriously questioned. Moreover, even if it was successful, it would not

lead to anything other than an increase in the number of qualified graduates, and thus escalate the diploma disease and rural-urban drift.

The Reality of Quality

One of the hopes expressed in the literature was, that not only could distance education increase the number of graduates, but that in doing so, it could provide a quality education by improved use of resources and reduced wastage as well as dropout (Edstrom 1966:Conclusion). Is this indeed the case? Has the advent of distance education systems in the Third World reduced dropouts and wastage?

Kinyanji (1975:182) rightly argued that dropouts were difficult to estimate, particularly in open courses. Nevertheless, he went on and noted that in the Kenyan School Certificate, there was only 15-25% failure rate amongst "highly motivated teachers", which, he implied, was some form of dropout or wastage. If this is the case then the promise of quality distance education must be questioned. The pass rate in Zambia Junior Secondary Certificate by correspondence was 17.6% in 1970 (CEDO 1974:250). In Tanzania the co-operative Correspondence Course had 50% dropout between 1965 and 1969 (Grabe 1975:602). In Jamaica the results were also discouraging, as the "unexceptional results" in 1971, show that of the 44,000 or so candidates who sat for the examination, 19,000 passed nothing at all, another 22,000 passed only one or four subjects and so did not qualify for the certificate, whilst just under 3,000 or 6% of the students passed five or more subjects (Ahmed and Coombes 1975:143). Fleming (1982:143) reported failure rates in Pakistan in 1979 of up to 99.5% of some subjects. Rumble noted (1982a:82) that dropout at UNED in Costa Rica was 74% in the 1980/1 graduation, whilst Datt (1982:64) stated that 35-40% was usual in India.

Although there are no consistent dropout or wastage figures, those given clearly throw the question of "improved use of resources" into doubt. A major reason for this, often overlooked by distance education educators, was that many young students had had no self-direction study experience, nor the motivation of the successful adult student (Kinyanji 1975:198; Ahmed and Coombes 1975:143). Thus, it is valid to question the ability of distance education to deliver quality education to a wide population in the Third World.

Further, clearly dropout and wastage are even more complex to calculate in the radio broadcasting area. In 1973 (CEDO 1974:236) however, a study found only 15% listened to radio lessons regularly, 37% occasionally, 22% seldom and 17% never, whilst 9% did not respond. Indeed, Arnove (1976b:2-3), in a

very powerful condemnation, argued that the showcase countries for educational television, were less than successful. El Salvador ETV only catered to 25% of those that entered primary. In Columbia, less than 10% of the children who started primary school in the countryside to receive ETV, completed this level. In Niger only 50% of the relevant school age ever went to school, never mind watched television. In American Samoa, the near universalisation of primary and secondary schools using ETV involved "massive disruption of traditional cultural patterns". These kinds of failure cannot be dismissed as atypical, because they represent a valid cross-section of distance education systems. Hence, they throw legitimate doubt on whether the promise of quality distance education in the Third World can be fulfilled.

It was observed earlier that part of the promise of quality distance education was that it could use modern technology within a multi-media approach. Unfortunately, in reality this line of argument has two weaknesses. The first is that often the new technology, particulary ETV, is simply inappropriate technology for the Third World. In fact Silk (1975:17) in an implied warning to the Third World, noted the London's Open University spent one third of its budget on television only to discover that few of its students were watching. Young et al (1980:49-54) argued that because of television's inherent heirarchical and one-way characteristics, American Samoan ETV after ten years was dead. In the Ivory Coast it survived, but in 1975 it depended on 187 expatriates, and in Niger it looked like a grand failure. In other words, the technology used was inappropriate for the conditions. But perhaps the most inappropriate aspect of the next technology was that

> ... the development of quality open learning is expensive.For underdeveloped countries this may be the greatest problem.
> (ICCE 1982:68)

The second weakness, which was implied above on several occasions, was that the production of quality material required experts who are not readily available in Third World. So there was a long and entrenched tradition of overseas experts being used in distance education (Kinyanji 1975:274; Edstrom 1966:226; CEDO 1974:199; Arnove 1976:155). The immediate consequence of this sort of involvement was that irrelevant programmes were often developed (Dodds 1975:41; Grabe 1975:614; Warr 1978:12; Scott 1973:49).

It was noted earlier that one of the arguments in favour of the promise of distance education being able to provide a quality education was the rise of professionalism, manifest in the development of manuals and the growth of professional bodies. The value of the manuals must be dismissed as of

limited value largely because of their eurocentric paternalism. Greenholm (1975:22) even felt obliged to suggest that carboard boxes would be of assistance in establishing a correspondence unit. On the more substantive side, Crocombe (1981:129), summed up the failings of professional bodies in his reply to the ASPESA President at the ASPESA Porum 1981:

> In congratulating Eric on his magnificent ideological statement we must remember that a major function of ideology is to hide reality. The ideology that Eric expanded so lucidly hid the important realities. It was in essence the same speech that we hear from almost every ambassador, every aid delegation, who rather than saying; "What we are about to do is going to strengthen the 'donors' and increase your dependency", say, "We are here in a spirit of co-operation as equals".

In fact the Suva Conference probably had no impact whatever on regional co-operation. There was a lot of rhetoric but no action.

To reiterate: the reality is that distance education cannot deliver quality education until the necessary socio-economic pre-requisites are established. This is necessarily a process of fundamental structural politico-economic change which goes far beyond mere educational reforms.

The Reality of Equality

Perhaps the most optimistic promise that distance education evokes is that in offering education to the masses it can effect educational and social change. Unfortunately, this does not seem to have happened. The 'new target groups', if reached at all, are still the elite. Student profiles from Ghana and Papua New Guinea show a remarkable similarity (Ansere 1978:23; Kember 1981:310). This should not be surprising, even if it is disappointing, because there is evidence in the literature that distance education is used by the elite, much the same as they use any other educational process. Rumble and Keegan (1982:208) argued that Distance Teaching Universities have been used, as in Iran, as a means of keeping students out of the campuses where it is likely they will be "politicised". Silk (1975:17) referred to the far more obvious manipulation of distance education by a minority elite, at the University of South Africa where, the President said, "we fit right into government policy, ... we are providing separate and equal

education". Arnove (1976:xiv) wrote cogently and in detail about the use of ETV by the dominant elite.

He argued that ETV:

> ... generally had not been aimed at teaching the most disadvantaged population, the rural poor and urban unemployed and their children ... content is often inappropriate and represents models of behaviour and values which are characteristic of the dominant groups in society ... With regard to ETV utilisation for social development these progammes tend to be used for purposes of domesticating and channeling change in directions desired by existing elites, rather than develop the critical consciousness of program participants ...

He further argued that the consequences of this were: increased rural-urban migration; excessive strain on existing school resources; increased unemployed school leavers problem; and increased dependence on foreign technical assistance, as well as external models of development, circumscribing the autonomy of a country to decide its own future. In other words, the consequences of this form of distance education was the very opposite of what the literature portrayed it as, Carnoy (1976:59) went even further when he concluded a detailed economic argument about El Salvador, Samoa, Niger, Puerto Rico, Korea, Ivory Coast and Nigeria's educational projects, with the scathing comment:

> ... None of the educational projects we have discussed in this chapter significantly change the distribution of education within the society, nor are they designed to effect fundamental economic and social change.

Yet, as was argued above, it is only through effecting socio-economic change that the promise of equality in education can be achieved.

Such manipulation of distance education by the dominant group is widespread. The promise of equality through distance education was dependent on opening formal education to the masses and also increasing informal education. Yet in Venezuela (Freidman 1978:12), in Costs Rica (Rumble 1978:27); in India (Pereira 1972:71), in Pakistan (Kaye 1978:10), and in Mexico (Schmelkes do Sotelo 1977:53), this was not the case.

As Ingle (1976:115) argued:

> ... because the expected outcomes of distance education linking the education sector with the socio-economic development thrust of the country - were largely left to chance on the assumption that things would take their course-reinforcement
> of the status quo occurred.

This was partly because education remained the monopoly of the relatively better-off students (Schmelkes do Sotelo 1977:45); partly because as Spain argued (1977:78) "it is not uncommon that innovations are used most by those who really need them least"; but moreso because the dominant group in society, by definition, dominates. This phenomenon also emerged in the resistance to distance education by elitist academics (Goodenough 1978:24; Friedman 1978:10; Singh 1982:65-66; Datt 1982:63; Dodds 1975:14). Thus, it is perhaps not too suprising that Adedeji noted "The absolute number of illiterates is increasing despite the literacy programmes" (Hakemulder 1979:20). It should, however, be emphasised that these literacy programmes were run in isolation to any socio-economic change (Kaye 1978:13; White 1977a:240).

The conclusion of Musto quoted in Beltran (1976:229), is also worthy of consideration. He reported that ACPO had not helped change the structure of Columbian society. Since these radiophonic schools were one of the major examples of rural education within distance education, such findings certainly shake the promise, and question the premises, of distance education's contribution to Third World development. In fact he continued to argue that ACPO had not achieved change in the prevailing social and economic structures, but rather that ACPO's radiophonic students were, as a rule, more conservative than peasants not under the influence of ACPO. The programme, he argued, produced frustrations which encouraged the peasant in his passivity and they no longer appeared very interested in literacy training (op. cit. 235).

He concluded that "ACPO may be helping to perpetuate the prevailing unjust social order" (op. cit. 241). However, what is perhaps even more condemnatory in terms of distance education's supposed momentum towards equality is Beltran's own argument (1976:239) that such apparent failings:

> ... may not be incompatible with ACPO's ideology, which puts the blame of backwardness on the individual's personality as if it were independent of the culture imposed by society, 2) identifies the locus of undevelopment in the persons mind, 3) consequently takes the transformation of

> individual mentality at the point of departure for development, 4) emphasises the growth of individuals and small groups (through motivational, cultural, productivity and social integration) over broader collective advancements, and 5) expects overall social transformation eventually to occur as a product of the long-term aggregation of individual progress.

Likewise, White (1977a:206) came to a similar conclusion for the case of Honduras.

In conclusion, perhaps Bandeira as a chief promoter of Brazil's Basic Education Movement (MEB), one of the few successful "Freirean" radiophonic literacy schools, should be given the last word. Unfortunately, it seems a reasonable reflection of distance education's failure to fulfil its promise of creating equality in education in the Third World.

> ... Many make use of modern and elaborate methods of transmission of information. But I should like to ask how many of them, consciously or unconsciously are aiming at the maintenance of a dual society with an elite versus the masses? (Beltran 1976:244)

Indeed how many?

The Reality of Cost-Effectiveness

Perhaps the most crucial aspect of distance education's promise is that it is cost-effective. It promises a quality, relevant education for the masses, which can effect educational and social change at less expense than conventional education. However, in reality this is more an article of faith than an inevitable result. Kinyanjui (1974a:31) noted that what may be an economical and effective model of education in one situation might turn out to be expensive and unsuitable in another. He went further and pinpointed that what Young et al (1980:14) called "economies of scale" was a "question of optimum numbers". Unfortunately, the only references in the literature to this problem were somewhat unrealistic, and indicate the depth of the problem. Jamison (Bates and Robinson, 1977:78), in one of the few attempts to face up to this crucial point, noted that in Korea if N = 100,000 the average cost per student per year is $22.36; if N = 1,000,000 this cost drops to $5.84. This cost included television, print and radio. Now this sort of cost is clearly attractive to the Third World, but 1,000,000 students is a somewhat unrealistic target number given the

above mentioned logistic problems within the Third World. Moreover, as Young et al (1980:58) rightly argued, it is often the small projects that have the greatest appeal. Given that this unreal attempt was one of the few attempts to quantify the "optimum of numbers", it is not suprising that Carnoy (1976:xiv) has pointing out that substantial investment of time, energy, and scarce resources, were being made by low income countries without adequate information on the economic returns.

The point was made above that the modern technology which has been suggested as suitable for distance education in the Third World, is expensive. What should also be stressed is that there is often a hidden socio-economic cost. Venezuela was obliged to buy expertise (Freidman 1978:24). In Columbia the Peace Corps had to be used (Perran and Kirst 1976:93)). In Samoa, American values were introduced into the society (Masland and Masland 1976:201). The social spin-off that the literature saw as a valuable aspect of cost effectiveness also has its hidden costs. Brumberg (1975:15) noted the ACPO had over 120 minutes of news per day and that much programming was built around music. The Commonwealth Secretariate (CEDO 1974:233) noted that in Kenya when the CCU realized 400,000 adults listened to their radio programmes, they modified the programmes. The point being that social spin-off like this reduced the pedagogical content of programmes and increased the hidden costs, therefore throwing doubt on the actual cost-effectiveness of distance education.

Thus, overall there are grave doubts as to whether the promise of cost-effectiveness is in fact, based on reality. The questions of optimum numbers and hidden costs, are unresolved. Indeed there seems a reluctance to examine such questions in any detail. However, as was argued above, the promise of cost-effectiveness was closely tied in with the promise of international aid. Despite the popular myth displayed in the literature, evidence outside of the literature shows that aid within the modernisation paradigm "is a waste for the poor in the Third World for whom it is supposedly designed to benefit" (New Internationalist 1979:3; see also Payer 1974). Aid benefits the 'core of the core' or the 'core of the periphery', and careful examination of modernisation literature show that this was, and is, its major intention. In a book actually financed by the Ford Foundation, (a foundation which significantly Henry Ford himself said, "was a creature of capitalism"), it was said "there are foreign policy imperatives, in the name of which universities are influenced to participate in international educational exchange and to co-operate with government programmes" (Deutsch 1970:183). A Carnegie Foundation representative, Alan Pifer, was even more blunt when he said, "the basis of our concern with Africa in the future is self interest". Perhaps the clearest admission that aid was, and is, designed to benefit the western capitalist donors was President Kennedy's comment that:

> ... Foreign aid is a method by which the U.S. maintains a position of influence and power around the world
> (New Internationalist 1979:3)

Ultimately, the role of aid giving "international agencies in education, in low income countries is to influence the change in certain directions consistent with the interests of the transnational bourgoisies" (Carnoy 1980:280; see also Berman 1971). It is within this perspective that the promise of aid for distance education must be seen. In the final analysis then, the promise of cost-effective distance education systems in the Third World is at the best based on doubtful costing, at the worst, it is deliberate deceit.

Conclusion

What emerges from a critical review of the literature is a suggestion that in reality distance education's promise of being able to provide a quality, cost-effective education for the masses of the Third World remains unfulfilled because the modernisation paradigm on which it is based consists of false assumptions. A critical analysis of the literature indicates that in reality development is not linear. It, like underdevelopment, is an historic process which is continued by maintaining the international order for the benefit of the internal and external elite. Thus, the premise that distance education can overcome the so called 'internal deficiencies which prevent development', is incorrect. Distance education like other modes of education based on the modernisation paradigm, cannot fulfill its promise without associated socio-economic change and a shift away from enthnocentric naive assumptions about implementation strategies. Without such changes distance education can do no more than maintain the status quo. Any education system which "attempts to help students to liberate themselves from poverty, ignorance and exploitation, and an elite political and economic system which seeks to maintain itself and its privileges cannot be in harmony with each other" (Young et al 1980:101; see also P. Freire 1975, 1977). A critical analysis of the literature suggests that for distance education to fulfill its promise the underlying premise must be changed to one that embraces the assumption that strategies of liberation which foster egalitarian socio-economic and politico-cultural change are attainable, and desirable.

Distance educators must look beyond the mere technical application of their system. They must question and change the 'real politique' of development to ensure that distance education systems are implemented within a development paradigm which is relevant to the Third World, rather than to the industrial world.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

ADEDEGI, Professor (1979), "Plenary Session Proceedings of an International Seminar" in HAKEMULDER, J. (1979) Distance Education for Development. Bonn, German Foundation for International Development.

AGARWAL, N. (1976), "Who Watches Indians Schoolroom in the Sky". New Scientist, 24th June, 1976.

AHMED, M. & COOMBE, P.A. (eds.) (1975), Education for Rural Development. New York, Praeger.

ANSERE, J. (1978), "A Profile of Correspondence Students in Ghana". Epistolodidaktika, Vol. 2, 1978, pp. 3-28.

ANSERE, J. (1982), "The Inevitability of Distance Education in Africa". In DANIEL, et al (1982), pp. 53-61.

ARNOVE, R.F. (ed.)(1976a), Educational Television: A Policy Critique and Guide for Developing Countries. New York, Praeger.

ARNOVE, R.F. (1976b), "Sociopolitical Implications of Educational Television". In ARNOVE (1976a), Chapter 1.

BATES, T. & ROBINSON, J. (1977), Evaluating Television and Radio. Milton Keynes, Open University Press.

BEARDSLEY, J.R. (1975), "The Free University of Iran". In MACKENZIE, N., POSTGATE, R., SCUPHAM, J. (1975), Open Learning. Paris, UNESCO Press, pp. 184-208.

BERMAN, E.H. (1971), "American Influence in African Education". Comparative Education Review, 15.

BELTRAN, L.R. (1976), "Social Structure and Rural Development Communication in Latin America. The Radio Phonic Schools of Columbia". In CHU, G., RAHIM, S. & KINCAID, L. Communication For Group Transformation in Development. Honolulu, East West Centre.

BLAUG, M. (1970), An Introduction to the Economics of Education. Ringwood, Penguin.

BRUMBERG, S.F. (1975), "Columbia: A Multimedia Rural Education Program". In AHMED, M. & COOMBS, P.H. (eds.)(1975).

CARNOY, M. (1976), "The Economic Costs and Returns to Educational Television". In ARNOVE, (1976a), Chapter 2.

CARNOY, M. (1980), "The International Institutions and Educational Policy: A Review of Education Sector Policy". Prospects 10(3).

CASSIPER, H.R. (1977), "Radio in an African Context". In Radio for Education and Development (1977), Washington, World Bank.

CEDO (1974), New Media in Education in the Commonwealth: a study conducted by the Centre for Educational Development Overseas and the Commonwealth Secretariat. London, Commonwealth Secretariat.

CROCOMBE, R. (1981), "Reply to Plenary Address". In ASPESA (1981), pp. 129-132.

DATT, R. (1982), "Problems of Distance Education in Developing Countries". In DANIEL et al, (1982). pp. 63-65.

DUETSCH, S.E. (1970), International Education and Exchange. Cleveland, Case Western University.

DODDS, T. (1972), Multimedia Approaches to Rural Education. Cambridge, International Extension College.

DODDS, T. (1973a), "Vocational Education at a Distance". Convergence, Vol. 6 (3-4).

DODDS, T. (1973b), "INADES - A Case Study in Correspondence Education in Africa". In KABWASA, A. & KAUNDA, M.A. (eds.)(1973), Correspondence Education in Africa. London, Routledge and Kegan Paul.

DODDS, T. (1975), The Mauritius College of the Air: The First Two Years. Cambridge, International Extension College.

DORE, J. (1976), The Diploma Disease. New York, George Allen & Unwin.

EDSTROM, L. (1966), Correspondence Education in Ethiopia, Kenya, Tanzania, Malawi, Zambia and Uganda: Experiences, Needs and Interests. Stockholm, Dag Hammarskjold Foundation.

EDSTROM, L. (1969), "Correspondence Education and Aid to Developing Countries". In 8th ICCE Conference Proceedings. ERDOS (ed.)(1969). Paris, UNESCO Press.

EDSTROM, L., ERDOS, R., PROSSER, R. (eds.), 1970. Mass Education Studies in Adult Education and Teaching by Correspondence in Some Developing Countries. New York, African Publishing Company.

EL-BUSHRA, J. (1973), Correspondence Teaching at University. Cambridge, International Extension College.

ERDOS, R. (1973), "UNESCO and Correspondence Education for Teachers". In KABWASA & KAUNDA, (1973). Chapter 7.

ERDOS, R. & CLARK, J.H. (1971), Correspondence Courses for In Service Teacher Training at Primary Level in Developing Countries. Hamburg, UNESCO Institute for Education.

FALKES, J. (1973), Technical Education at a Distance. Cambridge, International Extension College.

FLEMING, A. (1982), "The Allama Iqbal Open University, Pakistan". In RUMBLE, G. & HARRY, K. (1982). The Distance Teaching Universities. London, Croom Helm, Chapter 2.

FREIRA, P. (1975), Pedagogy of the Opressed. Ringwood, Penguin

FREIDMAN, A. (1978), A Case Study in Distance Learning Systems. Universidad Abierta of Venezuela. Milton Keynes, Open University Press.

GOODENOUGH, S. (1978), A Case Study in Distance Learning Systems. Punjab University. Milton Keynes, Open University Press.

GRABE, S. (1975), "Tanzania, An Educational Program for Co-operatives". In AHMED AND COOMBES. (1975), Chapter 16.

GREENHOLM, L.H. (1975), Radio Study Group Campaigns in the United Republic of Tanzania. Paris, UNESCO Press.

GUPTA, A.K. (1982), "The Status of Correspondence Education in India. A Survey". In DANIEL et. al. (1982), pp. 65-67.

HAKEMULDER J. (1979), Distance Education for Development. Bonn, German Foundation for International Development.

HARRY, K. (1978), A Case Study in Distance Learning Systems. The University of Lagos Correspondence and Open Studies Unit. Milton Keynes, Open University Press.

HEAP, W. (1972), "Correspondence Education: Zambia is Different". Zambian Education Journal, Vol. 1(2), January 1972, pp. 12-13.

HOLMBERG, B. (1979), "Address to International Seminar in Addis Adaba, 1979". In HAKEMULDER, (1979)

HOLMBERG, B. (1981), Trends and Status of Distance Education. New York, Nichols Publishers.

HOOPER, R. (1976), "Some Recent Mexican Educational Developments". Educational Broadcasting International, September 1976, pp. 59-61.

HURLEY, P. (1981), "Botswana - Distance Education in an African Multicultural Context". In ASPESA (1981), pp. 353-360.

INGLE, H. (1976), "Reconsidering the Use of Television for Educational Reform". In ARNOVE, (1976a), Chapter 4.

ICCE (1982), Learning at a Distance: a World Perspective. Daniel, J.S., Stroud, M.A. and Thompson, J.D. (eds.), Edmonton, Althabasca/ICCE.

KABWASA, A. (1969), "The Training of Manpower by Correspondence Education in African Countries". In 8th ICCE Conference Proceedings. ERDOS (ed.)(1969), pp. 243-255.

KABWASA, A. (1973a), "Correspondence Courses for Training in Public Administration". In KABWASA AND KAUNDA (1973), Chapter 46.

KABWASA, A. (1973b), "In-service Training in Africa". In KABWASA AND KAUNDA (1973), Chapter 6.

KABWASA, A. & KAUNDA, M.A. (eds.)(1973), Correspondence Education in Africa. London, Routledge and Kegan Paul.

KAGARUKI, G.E. & MWAKAJOBE (1973), "Correspondence Education in Co-operative Training". In KABWASA & KAUNDA (1973), Chapter 3.

KAYE, A. (1978), The Allama Iqbal Open University Pakistan. A Case Study in Distance Learning. Milton Keynes, Open University Press.

KEMBER, D. (1981), "Distance Education at the University of Papua New Guinea. The Students and Their Problems". In ASPESA (1981), pp. 298-310.

KEEGAN, D.J. (1984), Distance Education: Theory and Practice, Canberra, Croom Helm.

KINYANJUI, P. (1972), "Recent Developments in Radio/ Correspondence Education in Kenya". Convergence, Vol. 2, pp. 51-79, 1972.

KINYANJUI, P. (1974a), Training Teachers by Correspondence, Cambridge, International Extension College.

KINYANJUI, P. (1975), "Kenya the Use of Radios and Correspondence Education for the Improvement of Teaching". In MACKENZIE, POSTGATE AND SCUPHAM (1975), pp. 254-272.

KINYANJUI, P. (1977), "In-service Training for Teachers Through Radio and Correspondence in Kenya". In SPAIN, P., JAMISON, T. AND McANNAY, E.G. (eds.)(1977), Radio for Education and Development: Case Studies. Washington, The World Bank.

KIPKORIR, B.E. (1975), "Kenya: Development and Co-ordination of Non-formal Programs". In AHMED & COOMBS, Chapter 5.

MASLAND, L. & MASLAND, G. (1976), "Some Cross Cultural Implications of Educational Television". The Samoan ETV Project. In ARNOVE (1976a), Chapter 6.

NEW INTERNATIONALIST (1979), The Foreign Aid Link. No. 82, 1979.

NSIBANDZE, M.J. & GREEN, C. (1978), "In-Service Teacher Training in Swaziland". Prospects, Vol. 8, No. 1.

PEREIRA, E. (1969), "Pertinent Dimensions Correspondence Institutions in Malaysia". In The Changing World of Correspondence Education, Mackenzie, O., and Christensen, E.L. (eds.)(1971), Pennsylvania State University Press, Pennsylvania.

PEREIRA, E. (1972), "New Developments in Asia". Prospects, Vol. 5, No. 3.

PERRATON, H. (1973), The Techniques of Writing Correspondence Courses. Cambridge, International Extension College.

PERRON, W. & KIRST, M. (1976), "Organisational and Administrative Considerations". In ARNOVE (1976a), Chapter 3.

PETROUCHINE, S. (1969), "Correspondence Education in UNESCO Activities". In 8th ICCE Conference Proceedings. ERDOS (ed.)(1969), pp. 299-303.

PIRES, E.A. & BARTRAM, B. (1975), "Teachers for Refugees: the UNRWA UNESCO Institute for Education, Beirut, Lebanon". In MACKENZIE, POSTGATE & SCUPHAM (1975), pp. 274-294.

PAYER, C. (1974), The Debt Trap: The IMF and the Third World. Markham, Penquin.

ROGERS & BRAUN (1977), Radio Forums, a Strategy for Rural Development. In SPAIN et. al., (1977).

RUMBLE, G. (1978), A Case Study in Distance Learning Systems. Costa Rica Universidad Estatal a Distancia. Milton Keynes, Open University Press.

RUMBLE, G. (1982a), "The Universidad Estatal a Distancia, Costa Rica". In RUMBLE & HARRY (eds.)(1982), The Distance Teaching Universities, Canberra, Croom Helm.

RUMBLE, G. & HARRY (eds.)(1982), The Distance Teaching Universities. Canberra, Croom Helm.

SCHMELKES de SOTELO, S. (1977), "The Radio Schools of the Tarahumara, Mexico: an evaluation." In SPAIN et. al. (1977).

SCOTT, G. (1973), "The U.N. Correspondence Courses for Training in Public Administration". In KABWASA & KAUNDA (1973), Chapter 5.

SILK, A. (1975), "University of South Africa, Worlds Oldest Correspondence School". Change, Winter 74-75.

SINGH, B. (1979), "Distance Education in Developing Countries". In HAKEMULDER (1979).

SINGH, G. (1982), "Distance Education in Developing Countries. The need for Central Planning". In DANIEL et. al. (1982), pp. 61-63.

STEWART, D., KEEGAN, D. & HOLMBERG, G. (1984), Distance Education: An International Perspective. Canberra, Croom Helm.

SPAIN, P.L. (1977), "The Mexican Radio Primaria Project". In SPAIN et. al. (1977).

WARR, D. (1978), "Evaluating Media in Malawi". Educational Broadcasting International, September 1978, pp. 121-123.

WIEDHAUP, C.J. (1976), "Planning Radio Supported Correspondence Education in a More Developed Developing Country". Epistolodidaktika, Vol. 1, 1976.

WHITE, R. (1977a), "Mass Communication of the Popular Promotion Strategy of Rural Development in Honduras". In SPAIN et. al. (1977.

WHITE, R. (1977b), "The Use of Radio in Primary and Secondary Formal Education. The Radio Santa Maria Model and the Domonican Republic". In SPAIN et. al. (1977).

YOUNG, M., PERRATON, H., JENKINS, J. & DODDS, T. (1980), Distance Teaching in the Third World. London, Routledge, Keegan & Paul.